

# Wayland Public Schools

## Custodial Department Summary

By



January 21, 2016

- **Overview:**

Edvocate has reported to Wayland that after a preliminary review of the custodial department metrics provided by the district that the project will not meet the hurdle to justify further analysis and expenditure. The following summary will share our reasons and provide recommendations for Wayland to consider as they evaluate a path forward.

- **Key Findings:**

- The current department is not over staffed but short staffed.
- There is a lack of sufficient supervision.
- There may be insufficient equipment on site.
- Outsourcing will not be cost effective.
- Current labor agreement is at the high end of the scale.

- **Custodial Metrics Comparisons:**

The following metric data is preliminary but will give a good sense of where Edvocate saw Wayland in a comparative picture. From a productivity perspective, the program is below an acceptable range, as the gross square feet per custodian is 26.697, while NJ (K-12) comparator average is 16,251 square feet per custodian. This is a load that does traditionally produce desired outcomes in a K-12 environment. The following cost metrics are unfavorable to that seen in the industry:

- The district's metric of custodial salaries per square foot, which excludes fringe benefits, of \$1.82 is higher than the American School and University's survey of \$1.35 but lower than NJ K-12 comparator standard of \$1.91.
- Custodial salaries per student, excluding fringe benefits costs, are higher than the AS&U survey of \$277.60 but well below the NJ K-12 comparator standard of \$541.11 while the district is \$331.88.

| <b>Comparison of School District Metrics to Wayland</b>   |   |                                      |                    |
|---|---|--------------------------------------|--------------------|
| <b>Category</b>   | <b>AS&amp;U 38th<br/>M &amp; O Survey (5)</b> | <b>NJ Comparator<br/>Average (1)</b> | <b>Wayland (2)</b> |
| Gross Sq Ft/Custodian (4)   | 32,100  | 16,157                               | 26,697             |
| Custodial Salaries/Sq Ft (3)  | \$1.35  | \$1.91                               | \$1.82             |
| Custodial Salaries/Student (3)  | \$277.60                                      | \$541.11                             | \$331.88           |
| Square Footage per Student  | -   | 122-235                              | 183                |
| <b>Data Used in Calculations</b>  |   |                                      |                    |
| Total Student Enrollment  | 2,659   |                                      |                    |
| District Gross Square Footage   | 485,559                                       |                                      |                    |
| Total District Custodial Salaries (3)   | \$882,459                                     |                                      |                    |
| <p>1. NJ Comparator Costs determined by comparing the data from 20 other NJ districts that have outsourced all or some of the facilities operations.</p> <p>2. Data taken from current cost.</p> <p>3. Salaries do not include fringe benefits and payroll taxes.</p> <p>4. Includes the Floaters if any</p> <p>5. Taken from American School &amp; University Magazine's 38th Annual Survey of <u>school district</u> maintenance and operations</p> |   |                                      |                    |

- The Following Table Represents the Probability of Financial Impact if the Program is outsourced.

## Program Comparisons Based on 2015-2016 Costs

| Category   | Current Program<br>2015-2016 |                |              | Option 1 - All Custodial Positions Outsourced |             |             |                    |              |              |
|--|------------------------------|----------------|--------------|---|-------------|-------------|--------------------|--------------|--------------|
| Description  | District                     |                |              | District                                      |             |             | Contracted         |              |              |
|  | Costs                        | FTEs           | Pos.         | Costs   | FTEs        | Pos.        | Costs              | FTEs         | Pos.         |
| <b>Total Management and Clerical Costs</b>                             |                              |                |              |   |             |             |                    |              |              |
| <i>Number of Management</i>  | -                            | 0.00           | 0.00         | -   | 0.00        | 0.00        | -                  | 2.00         | 2.00         |
| <i>Number of Clerical</i>  | -                            | 0.00           | 0.00         | -   | 0.00        | 0.00        | -                  | 0.50         | 1.00         |
| Supervisor of B & G (3 & 6)  | \$0                          | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | -                  | -            | -            |
| Director (3 & 6)   | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$0                | -            | -            |
| Assistant Manager  | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$0                | -            | -            |
| Maintenance Manager/s  | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$0                | -            | -            |
| General Manager/s  | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$80,000           | -            | -            |
| Custodial Supervisor/s   | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$55,000           | -            | -            |
| Administrative Support (3 & 6)   | \$0                          | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$21,840           | -            | -            |
| Fringe Benefits & Taxes (1 & 2)  | \$0                          | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$34,008           | -            | -            |
| <b>Total Management Costs</b>  | <b>\$0</b>                   | <b>0.00</b>    | <b>0.00</b>  | <b>\$0</b>                                    | <b>0.00</b> | <b>0.00</b> | <b>\$190,848</b>   | <b>2.50</b>  | <b>3.00</b>  |
| <b>Custodial Costs</b>   |                              |                |              |   |             |             |                    |              |              |
| <i>Number of Custodial</i>   | -                            | 18.1875        | 19.00        | -   | 0.00        | 0.00        | -                  | 20.50        | 21.00        |
| <i>Number of Head Custodians</i>                                       | -                            | 0.00           | 0.00         | -   | 0.00        | 0.00        | -                  | 5.00         | 5.00         |
| Custodial Salaries (3 & 4)   | \$882,459                    | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$826,800          | -            | -            |
| Head Custodian Salaries (3, 6)   | \$0                          | -              | -            | \$0   | -           | -           | -                  | -            | -            |
| Custodian Subs/OT Salaries (3, 8, 9)                                   | \$88,724                     | -              | -            | \$0   | -           | -           | \$49,608           | -            | -            |
| Fringe Benefits & Taxes (1, 2 & 7)                                     | \$346,910                    | -              | -            | \$0   | -           | -           | \$268,395          | -            | -            |
| Additional Needed New Equipment (5)                                    | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$10,625           | -            | -            |
| Uniforms & Training (9)  | \$7,578                      | -              | -            | \$0   | -           | -           | Included           | -            | -            |
| <b>Total Custodial Costs</b>   | <b>\$1,325,672</b>           | <b>18.1875</b> | <b>19.00</b> | <b>\$0</b>                                    | <b>0.00</b> | <b>0.00</b> | <b>\$1,155,428</b> | <b>25.50</b> | <b>26.00</b> |
| <b>Contractor Tax, Profit, On Going and Indirect Costs</b>             |                              |                |              |   |             |             |                    |              |              |
| Contractor Tax and Profit  | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$80,000           | -            | -            |
| Contractor Indirect Costs (7)  | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$16,437           | -            | -            |
| Contractor On-Going Costs  | -                            | -              | -            | -   | -           | -           | \$22,553           | -            | -            |
| <b>Contractor Total</b>  | <b>\$0</b>                   | <b>-</b>       | <b>-</b>     | <b>\$0</b>                                    | <b>-</b>    | <b>-</b>    | <b>\$118,990</b>   | <b>-</b>     | <b>-</b>     |
| <b>Sub Total for Managerial, Clerical, Custodial and Grounds Costs</b> |                              |                |              |   |             |             |                    |              |              |
| <i>Sub Total- District &amp; Contracted FTE's/ Positions (7)</i>       | -                            | 18.1875        | 19.00        | -   | 0.00        | 0.00        | -                  | 28.00        | 29.00        |
| <i>Sub Total - District &amp; Contracted Program Cost</i>              | <b>\$1,325,672</b>           | <b>-</b>       | <b>-</b>     | <b>\$0</b>                                    | <b>-</b>    | <b>-</b>    | <b>\$1,465,266</b> | <b>-</b>     | <b>-</b>     |
| <b>Total Program Cost &amp; Number of FTEs</b>                         |                              |                |              |   |             |             |                    |              |              |
| <i>Total FTEs/ Positions</i>   | -                            | 18.19          | 19.00        | -   | 0.00        | 0.00        | -                  | 28.00        | 29.00        |
| <b>Total Program Cost</b>  | <b>\$1,325,672</b>           | <b>-</b>       | <b>-</b>     | <b>\$1,465,266</b>                            | <b>-</b>    | <b>-</b>    | <b>-</b>           | <b>-</b>     | <b>-</b>     |
| <b>Difference from Current Program</b>                                 | <b>NA</b>                    | <b>-</b>       | <b>-</b>     | <b>\$139,595</b>                              | <b>-</b>    | <b>-</b>    | <b>9.8</b>         | <b>10.00</b> | <b>-</b>     |
| <b>Percent Increase from Current Program</b>                           | <b>NA</b>                    | <b>-</b>       | <b>-</b>     | <b>11%</b>                                    | <b>-</b>    | <b>-</b>    | <b>54%</b>         | <b>53%</b>   | <b>-</b>     |

### Footnotes to Program Comparisons Scenarios/Options Based on 2015-2016 Costs

- (1) Salaries, Benefits and taxes for district staff are calculated based on a combination of actual and budgeted costs for 2015-2016.
- (2) Benefits and taxes for contracted staff are calculated using 29.3% rate of payroll. Contractor will be required to provide competitive benefits (health care, 401K, prescription drugs, dental, etc.) as dictated by the request for proposal document.
- (3) The average wage rate for the contracted custodial staff is \$15.00 per hour and head custodians is \$18.00 per hour.
- (4) The contractor will supply \$50,000 of equipment over the course of the contract which will be depreciated over 5 years & revert to District ownership at the end of 5 years (end of contract term). The District will provide all custodial supplies and allow the contracted company to use current district equipment.
- (5) The Facilities Manager, maintenance employees and District administrative support positions remain on district payroll.
- (6) The district custodial staff has 41 to 58 possible holiday, sick, personal, family, vacation and bereavement time; contracted will have 18 to 28 days. The difference in possible paid days off equals an additional 1.6 to 2.1 contracted FTEs.
- (7) Included 2,122 contracted overtime hours.
- (8) District uniform cost 2014-2015 actual.

**Staffing Summary:**

| Staffing Summary Current vs. Proposed Program<br>Option 1 - All Custodial Positions Outsourced  |                       |                              |               |                 |              |                |
|---|-----------------------|------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|--------------|----------------|
| Building Name / Position  | Gross Square Footages | Gross Sq Ft per FTE Proposed | Proposed      |                 |              | Current        |
|   |                       |                              | District FTEs | Contracted FTEs | Total FTEs   | District FTEs  |
| Claypit Hill School   | 63,405                | 18,116                       | -             | 3.50            | 3.50         | 2.875          |
| Happy Hollow School   | 47,992                | 15,997                       | -             | 3.00            | 3.00         | 2.875          |
| Loker School  | 49,560                | 16,520                       | -             | 3.00            | 3.00         | 1.9375         |
| Wayland Middle School   | 124,311               | 20,719                       | -             | 6.00            | 6.00         | 3.875          |
| Wayland High School   | 200,291               | 22,255                       | -             | 9.00            | 9.00         | 6.625          |
| Floater   | -                     | -                            | -             | 1.00            | 1.00         | 0.00           |
| <b>Sub Total Custodians</b>   | <b>485,559</b>        | <b>19,819</b>                | <b>0.00</b>   | <b>25.50</b>    | <b>25.50</b> | <b>18.1875</b> |
| Supervisor of B & G   | -                     | -                            | 0.00          | 0.00            | 0.00         | 0.00           |
| General Manager   | -                     | -                            | -             | 1.00            | 1.00         | 0.00           |
| Custodial Supervisors   | -                     | -                            | -             | 1.00            | 1.00         | 0.00           |
| Administrative Support  | -                     | -                            | -             | 0.50            | 0.50         | 0.00           |
| <b>Sub - Total Mgmt. &amp; Clerical</b>   | <b>-</b>              | <b>-</b>                     | <b>0.00</b>   | <b>2.50</b>     | <b>2.50</b>  | <b>0.00</b>    |
| <b>Total</b>  | <b>485,559</b>        | <b>19,819</b>                | <b>0.00</b>   | <b>28.00</b>    | <b>28.00</b> | <b>18.1875</b> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The district custodial staff has 41 to 58 possible holiday, sick, personal, family, vacation and bereavement time; contracted will have 18 to 28 days. The difference in possible paid days off equals an additional 1.6 to 2.1 contracted FTEs.</li> <li>• Total Custodial Productivity does not include the floaters.</li> </ul> |                       |                              |               |                 |              |                |

- The impact areas for additional staff can be seen in the above chart. Both the High School and Middle School require significant additional staffing, just over 2 FTE per site. We based this assumption on 2 factors;
  - The increased square footage and complexity of the High School
  - The heavy volume of community use in the buildings
- Cost impact for outsourced custodial help has risen dramatically in the greater Boston area in the last 2 years. It now runs 17-20% above national averages.

## Moving Forward:

Accepting the projection that outsourcing will not bring financial benefits to Wayland, There are steps that Wayland can take to mitigate costs and address quality issues.

- Add the supervisory position at night.
  - The majority of custodial tasks take place on second shift.
- Stage the increase in staffing in schools.
  - High School is a priority followed by Middle.
- Immediate equipment assessment and budget line to bring to standards.
  - We assumed a minimum of \$50K spread over 5 years
- Utilize a floater to cover short fall and projects
- Begin to address the excesses in the current CBA
  - Paid time off
  - Two tier approach to wages for new hires
- Implementation of a training schedule
- Implement written standards and procedures across the district!
  - Then inspect on quarterly basis with formal written evaluation